

Criteria-Based Rating of Programs for Promoting Positive Behavior and Climate, a Caring Community, and Effective Classroom Management

	36 EVALUATIVE CRITERIA DIVIDED INTO 8 CATEGORIES – CRITERIA 1-12											
	PROGRAM LEVELS & RANGE					LEARNING MODES & INSTRUCTION						
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
PROGRAMS RELEVANT TO CLASSROOM MANAGEMENT	Whole School Program	Individual Classrooms	Individual Teacher Assets	Inoculation; Prevention; Extent of Focus on Assets	Intervention with At-Risk Students; FBA/BIP	Ethos Interpersonal and Environmental Support	Experiential Learning; Active Inquiry	Expectations Consequences Incentives Reinforcers	Examples Modeling; Social-Observational Learning	Explanation Direct Instruction	Extensions Home and Community	Explicit Standards and Standards Integration
POSITIVE BEHAVIORAL SUPPORTS: PBSS/PBIS/PBS SWPBS (Howard Knoff)	Primary focus with emphasis on integration into strategic planning and committees, and consistent expectations	Classrooms show the value of consistent and uniform expectations, responses, and social skills instruction	Not addressed: teacher skills implied, but no mention of personality, mental ability, knowledge, or skill variables	Via teaching social skills, reinforcement of positive behavior, FBA; intervention aspect of model is predominant.	A strength and well-structured and explicit since it extends FBA & RTI school-wide	Little focus on teacher-student relationships or use of terms that convey connection, attachment, caring, warmth	Mentioned only with regard to role playing in social skills teaching and using teachable moments	Heavy focus on a positive form of operant conditioning; extends FBA/RTI and applied behavior analysis to all	Mentioned mainly with respect to a step in social skills teaching	Explicitness about expected behaviors and consequences via behavior matrix, and the social skills being taught	Mention of connecting with parents and community with few specifics or talk of social-skill teaching extensions	Calls for integrating social and academic standards but with no guidelines for how to blend them
RESPONSIVE CLASSROOM MODEL (Chip Wood)	Achieved by teachers rallying around principles and building teacher-student relationships	Primary focus as reflected by lots of interaction, free choices, morning meetings, democratic community, etc.	Addressed in terms of skills and attitudes teachers need as detailed in <i>Teaching Children to Care</i>	A strength via morning meetings and a heavy focus on supportive relationships and community	Not addressed	Heavy emphasis on caring, supportive teacher-student and student-student relationships	Emphasis on guided inquiry and discovery and how students learn and not just what they learn	Rules and consequences used to foster responsibility and self-control, but this is not an emphasis	A lot of emphasis on learning routines to prevent problems	De-emphasized in favor of social-interactive learning	Among the best with specific strategies to reach out to parents	Explicit social standards such as acceptance, cooperation, caring, and friendliness
SOCIAL-EMOTIONAL LEARNING; Fast Track PATHS; CASEL (Maurice Elias)	Only through its focus on a standard set of social skills and dual focus on social and academic	Primary since specific social skills are taught in classrooms; teachers generalize from set lessons	Considered as a variable in Implementing a new Program; teachers' ability to generalize from lessons	Programs Contrast with Categorical Prevention Programs	The Fast-Track level of Fast-Track PATHS: small group social skills, home visits, etc. for at-risk	The social skills taught convey that mutual support and community are valued	Cooperative learning, service learning, etc. used to help teach a set of social skills	De-emphasized	An important learning mode since part of social skills teaching is modeling the social skills	Mainly through social skills instruction; teachers may generalize from skill lessons via direct teaching	Some example programs do this well such as Fast Track PATHS using parent training and home visits	Categorized social skills are identified and written as standards in social skill lessons
CHARACTER EDUCATION (Kevin Ryan & Eric Schaps)	Promotes core ethical values in all aspects of school life with these virtues selected for the whole school	This is the main focus through direct instruction, exemplars, and reinforcement	No mention of skills but stress teacher modeling virtues being taught	Real prevention with focus on assets and no focus of problems or intervention	Not addressed except that all are considered at-risk for a wide array of problems	Implicit in focus on a caring community and teachers as moral models	Giving students opportunity for moral action is one of the 11 principles and this is central in some programs	Some programs place lots of emphasis on recognition and awards for showing good character	Teachers are expected to be moral models and exemplars from history and literature are used	Teach about specific moral virtue concepts through explanations and stories	Newsletters, conveying word of the week, related homework, inclusion in events, etc.	Sometimes written as standards but are the same for all ages and not age appropriate
CHILD DEVELOPMENT PROJECT: DSC's CARING COMMUNITY (Eric Schaps)	Primary focus on building a caring community in the whole school and each classroom	Primary focus through daily cooperative learning, class meetings, and cross-grade buddies	More implicit than explicit but training gets into what teachers need to know and do.	Real prevention by building a caring community using class meetings, buddies, etc.	Not addressed	Heavy emphasis on teachers' interpersonal support and students supporting each other	Through cooperative learning, cross-grade buddies, and inquiry centers	Not addressed and even de-emphasized	Cross-grade buddy program provides models, and literature series does also	Provides specific works of literature to help teach prosocial behavior and moral lessons	Important component through "at home in our schools"	More implicit than explicit
SEARCH INSTITUTE DEVELOPMENTAL ASSETS (Peter Benson)	A whole community program that includes the schools via climate and boundaries	Implicit in list of external assets that includes caring school climate, support	Implicit in list of external assets that have to do with teacher support and teacher expectations	The most preventive by focusing on developmental asset building to prevent all at-risk behavior	Not addressed	Emphasized as important at home, school, and community	Reflected in the external assets: service to others, youth as resources, and youth programs	Reflected in the subcategory of developmental assets called boundaries and expectations	Reflected in the developmental asset, positive role models	Not addressed or implied	Reflected in assets about home and community support and constructive use of time	Explicit in 20 internal assets about motivation, values, social skills, and identity

	CONTINUED . . . 36 EVALUATIVE CRITERIA DIVIDED INTO 8 CATEGORIES – CRITERIA 1-12											
	LEVELS & RANGE					LEARNING MODES & INSTRUCTION						
	1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12
PROGRAMS RELEVANT TO CLASSROOM MANAGEMENT	Whole School Program	Individual Classrooms	Individual Teacher Assets	Inoculative Prevention Extent of Focus on Assets	Intervention with At-Risk Students FBA/BIP	<u>Ethos</u> Interpersonal and Environmental Support	<u>Experiential Learning; Active Inquiry</u>	<u>Expectations Consequences Incentives Reinforcers</u>	<u>Examples Modeling; Social-Observational Learning</u>	<u>Explanation Direct Instruction</u>	<u>Extensions Home and Community</u>	<u>Explicit Standards and Standards Integration</u>
DEVELOPMENTAL THEORY-BASED CHARACTER & COMMUNITY BUILDING (Gordon Vessels)	Goal is to build a caring school community in which character building infuses all aspects of school life	Primary focus on caring school and classroom communities and thus positive climate; key is relationships	Broken down into improvable (skills & knowledge) and relatively fixed (personality & mental abilities)	A strength as seen in focus on virtues and character assets and community building	Not emphasized	Identified as one of learning modes teachers must use, and a heavy focus on teacher-student relationships	Identified as the primary learning mode at all grade levels with multiple examples given	Identified as one of six learning modes that should be used, and examples of how are given	Identified as one of six learning modes via mentors, teachers, and stories of moral exemplars	Identified as one of six learning modes with a focus on virtue concepts and the use of literature	Identified as one of six learning modes via community service and youth programs in community	Specific character-building standards written for each of five developmental ranges
SCHOOL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM (James Comer)	Staff teamwork focus; no fault, collaboration, consensus; school part of child's primary social network	Stress students' emotional bond with teachers and six developmental paths as a framework for instruction plan	Assets not listed but the desire to be positive and personal with students and parents is critical	The best at connecting primary and secondary social networks for support and prevention	Built around assumption that many enter school negative and at-risk and need to acquire positive attitude	This is the heart and soul of SDP and the effort to work as a team to support extends outside the school	Not labeled as a method but implied in focus on social and ethical growth and preparing students to be successful in life	No shying away from timeout to reduce behavior but is anti-punishment; theme of caring but expectant as developers	Students will internalize and model positive attitudes of teacher if attached to teachers emotionally	Not stressed and presumably one learning mode used but used less than others	Instructional extensions are a part of program making school a primary part of the community support network	Standards are reflected in six developmental pathways that are addressed in instruction planning and all parts of school

See criteria 13-24 directly below.

Criteria-Based Rating of Programs for Promoting Positive Behavior and Climate, a Caring Community, and Effective Classroom Management

	CONTINUED . . . 36 EVALUATIVE CRITERIA DIVIDED INTO 8 CATEGORIES – CRITERIA 13-24											
	FOCUS ON CLIMATE/COMMUNITY/CULTURE/COLLECTIVE							FOCUS ON RELATIONSHIPS				
	13	14	15	16	17	18	19	20	21	22	23	24
PROGRAMS RELEVANT TO CLASSROOM MANAGEMENT	Caring Community Sense of Community	Positive School & Classroom Climate	Community & Family Engagement	Cultural Adaptation Literacy	Social Justice Elements	Service to Others	Staff Consistency Cohesion	Supportive Teacher-Student Relations	Cooperative Learning Teamwork	Student Mentoring Tutoring	Social Problem Solving	Teaching Social Skill
POSITIVE BEHAVIORAL SUPPORTS: PBSS/PBIS/PBS SWPBS (Howard Knoff)	The terms “caring” and “community” are not used; more of a behavioral focus on climate	The terms “positive climate” are used and this is achieved by using behavioral supports	Mentioned but with little elaboration or specific strategies; role of parents is to support plan	Not addressed	Not addressed except for what is implicit in anti-bullying as a particular bad behavior to prevent	Not addressed	Strong emphasis on consistency in behavioral expectations and responses from staff	5-to-1 ratio of positive to negative interactions, but close supportive relationships are not stressed	Mentioned but not elaborated; an apparent means of building social skills	Not mentioned	Included as a specific category or type of social skills to be taught	Specific steps for teaching several categories of social skills such as interpersonal
RESPONSIVE CLASSROOM MODEL (Chip Wood)	Main focus and very important as reflected in frequent use of these terms	Reflective of true community building which runs deeper than climate	Some specific strategies	Emphasis on knowing students culturally and individually	Not global intercultural but in-school community concepts	Compatible and listed but not a corner-stone method	Staff pulls together around shared principles but with discretion	Big emphasis on teachers being warm and caring and showing interest	Assumed to be common based on maximizing interpersonal interaction	Consistent with philosophy and a likely part of school programs	Among a half dozen social skills identified and taught in natural social situations	Social skills and character assets taught together but not written in standards
SOCIAL-EMOTIONAL LEARNING; Fast Track PATHS; CASEL (Maurice Elias)	Mainly a product of teaching social skills some skills tied to caring community	Direct reference to the importance of a positive climate and safe environment	Systematic school-family-community approaches and parents trained visited in Fast-Track PATHS	Some programs like Fast Track PATHS have strategies that are adapted to at-risk kids and low SES school	This seems to be one purpose of programs but not a focus in terms of instructional objectives	School or community service is on of the key components of SEL and related skills are taught	Consistency with respect to social skills taught, but this is not strongly emphasized	One of the key parts of SEL is respectful and supportive teacher-student relationships	Interactive instruction and frequent participation are basic which implies cooperative learning	Not listed as a part but the emphasis on relationships is consistent with mentoring and tutoring	Reflected in 3 social skill categories: social awareness, manage relationships, decisions	Direct and experiential teaching of self-awareness, social awareness, and other social skills
CHARACTER EDUCATION (Kevin Ryan; Eric Schaps)	Included in 11 principles that characterize traditional and progressive programs	Implicit in focus on community which brings with it a positive climate	One of 11 principles is to recruit parents and community members as full partners	Reference to curriculum that respects all learners but not consistently multicultural	This also implies a sensitivity to or awareness of social injustice which is not a focus	Service is not specified in 11 principles but opportunities for moral action is specified	One of 11 principles refers to staff becoming a learning and moral community	Programs stress building caring communities and helping all to learn and some stress relationships	Though not reflected in the 11 principles most identify this as a valuable strategy	Though not noted in the 11 principles, some programs use cross grade buddies and adult mentors	Most programs do not focus on this but some experts have listed this as a strategy.	Character traits and social skills are viewed as mutually supportive but more focus on the former
CHILD DEVELOPMENT PROJECT: DSC’s CARING COMMUNITY (Eric Schaps)	The most important goal in this model	Positive climate assured by caring community	Specific methods used and guided by such sources as <i>At Home in Our Schools</i>	The collection of children’s literature is multicultural and the model has succeeded in inner city	Focus on elementary school largely precludes this	Service is limited for the most part to cross-grade buddy activities called “That’s My Buddy.”	Extensive pre-program training with an emphasis on 100% buy-in and working together	More emphasis put on relationships in this model than all or most others	Cooperative learning is expected from all teachers at some time during every school day	No adult mentoring component, but older students mentor younger	Social problem solving occurs mainly through class meetings with use of the terms “rough spots”	No step by step approach but building social competence is an important goal
SEARCH INSTITUTE DEVELOPMENTAL ASSETS (Peter Benson)	As a product of communitarian thinking, this is central with assets of caring and support from adults	Implicit only	Engagement is a given since the model is a whole community model and not based in schools	Diversity and multicultural issues are not addressed	Social justice issues are not addressed	Service to others is listed and elaborated as one of the 20 internal developmental assets	Not addressed but there is a theme of community members working together	Not listed as one of the 40 assets, but it is implicit in two or three external assets	Not addressed	Implied by the developmental asset about supportive relationships with other adults	Peaceful conflict resolution is one of the internal developmental assets	Social skills is an asset category with social skills teaching implied
DEVELOPMENT THEORY-BASED CHARACTER &	Primary goal achieved through service	Part of caring community-focus, and	Mentioned but with only a few strategies	Included in character standards for	Implicit in upper-grade standards and	Service learning is identified as an essential	Through core curricular virtues and	Identified as a cornerstone for character	Cooperative learning is a recommended	Described in character and community	Identified as important with information on	Several good social skills curricula are

COMMUNITY BUILDING (Gordon Vessels)	learning, class meetings, cooperative learning, etc.	school and class climate instruments are used	besides community service	teens and call for multicultural teaching in all subject areas	in multi-culturalism as a category of strategies	strategy among several	coming together to build a caring community	building with ideas offered for how to maximize this	strategy, and teamwork is a virtue in the curriculum	development as effective, and guidelines are offered	how to do this on many levels from individual to global	described like Skillstreaming and I Can Problem Solve
SCHOOL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM (James Comer)	This is a central feature and it goes beyond community to classrooms as families and relationships	Positive school and classroom climates as a result of focus on being positive and relationships	No school reform program does more to engage families and community and this is really a centerpiece	Comer's intent was to build a program that would allow underprivileged students to succeed in life	SDP school is a just society model, and fairness and justice are identified under ethical development	Service learning is not stressed in the model but staff model service to students and parents	Heavy focus on teachers pulling together as a team with some structuring in committees and training	The terms "emotional attachment" are used to describe goal of teacher-student relationships	Teamwork is a major goal for staff and students and cooperative learning is assumed	Consistent with philosophy but not addressed specifically	This is an instructional objective and viewed as part of preparing students for success in life	No mention of a particular social skills program but social development is a pathway of development

See criteria 25-36 directly below.

Criteria-Based Rating of Programs for Promoting Positive Behavior and Climate, a Caring Community, and Effective Classroom Management

	CONTINUED . . . 36 EVALUATIVE CRITERIA DIVIDED INTO 8 CATEGORIES – CRITERIA 25-36											
	PROGRAM PLANNING & EVALUATION					MOTIVATION		CONTROL		MORAL CHARACTER		
	25	26	27	28	29	30	31	32	33	34	35	36
PROGRAMS RELEVANT TO CLASSROOM MANAGEMENT	Social-Moral Developmental Theory Base	Analysis of Discipline Data & School Data	Program Planning & Organization	Ongoing Data Gathering	Controlled Evaluation of Total Programs	Extrinsic Motivation	Intrinsic Motivation	Adult Control	Student Control	Moral Affect Empathy	Moral Character Assets	Moral Reasoning
POSITIVE BEHAVIORAL SUPPORTS: PBSS/PBIS/PBS SWPBS (Howard Knoff)	Social-emotional development mentioned but not a program nucleus or centerpiece	Important emphasis as seen in the use of the behavior matrix and use of discipline records to plan	Built around discipline data and integrated into school improvement plan and school committees	Definite given the focus on data in the design and on intervention via FBAs with at-risk students	Only a few semi-controlled studies: Lassen et al., Radshaw et al., Yeung, and Horner et al.	Use of operant conditioning is predominant with the stated goal of self-management; path to it vague	Self-management via social skills teaching and reinforcement but path to intrinsic not convincing	High as seen in use of operant conditioning, behavior matrix etc., but it has self-management as a goal	Limited to that implicit in goal of self-management and focus on social skill, but behavioral methods limit	Not addressed and these terms appear to be intentionally avoided, particularly the term "moral"	Not addressed and these terms appear to be intentionally avoided, particularly the term "moral"	Not addressed since the word "moral" is not used, and there is no moral developmental theory linkage
RESPONSIVE CLASSROOM MODEL (Chip Wood)	Model based on developmental characteristics and theory with Constructivist elements	No mention of discipline data	Use training consultants emphasize teachers working together	Not emphasized	Several randomized quasi-experimental studies- one with 24 schools	Limited but reference to logical consequences for breaking rules	Strong emphasis on deep understanding of community membership	Limited to a Constructivist or Vygotskian type of control which is shared control	Emphasis on giving students choices in their learning and thus sharing control	Much emphasis on social learning and community membership	Not a word of the week but they teach character concepts communally	Much interaction which provides teachable moments and moral reasoning
SOCIAL-EMOTIONAL LEARNING; Fast Track PATHS; CASEL (Maurice Elias)	Some grounding in child and adolescent developmental theory and research	No mention and discipline is not a focus	Some programs have training by experts such as Fast Track PATHS; planning around set of social skills	Not stressed but there have been some good research studies that included good data collection	Quasi-experimental studies listed by CASEL and Elias and one by K. Bierman et al. 2010	There are few references to reinforcement, punishment, discipline, and operant conditioning	This is a primary goal as seen in its focus on skills of self-management, self-awareness, and relationships	Limited due to the heavy emphasis on active and interactive learning	Emphasizes self-direction during instruction and self-efficacy generally	Not emphasized to the degree social skills are but with skills related to empathy	Many programs in this broad category of programs do not specify character traits or virtues	Some in conjunction with the types of social skills taught
CHARACTER EDUCATION (Kevin Ryan; Eric Schaps)	Uncommonly based on developmental theory with a few exceptions	No mention other than using this as one outcome measure of effectiveness	Many program do not infuse all aspects of school as listed in 11 principles of CEP	Not a routine feature	Some quasi-experimental studies: Munoz; Corrigan et al.; Berkowitz; DeRosier et al.	Extensive in some and limited in others	Extensive in some and limited in others	Extensive in some and limited in others	Extensive in some and limited in others	A standard consideration but not often reflected in standards	A centerpiece for most programs	Only the more progressive programs and those for older students
CHILD DEVELOPMENT PROJECT: DSC's CARING COMMUNITY (Eric Schaps)	Based on the constructivist philosophy as applied to all elementary school children	Good program evaluation research that has included discipline data but not a planning step	Up front planning is among the most thorough but not routinely tied to discipline	CDR has been a model for evaluating such programs guided by the Developmental Studies Center	DSC has quasi-experimental studies: Chris Watkins in London Review of Ed.; Schaps; Battistich	No mention of reinforcement or punishment and follow Alfie Kohn's stand against rewards and punishment	This is their only focus as shown by most behavior issues being addressed in class meetings	Minimized as reflected in daily requirement of cooperative learning as use of older buddies	Maximized through cooperative learning, class meetings, use of cross-grade buddies	Emphasis on being sensitive to others and intrinsically motivated but no list of traits or virtues	Addressed indirectly by teaching how to be a caring and responsible community member	A part of the social problem solving that is accomplished mainly through class meetings
SEARCH INSTITUTE DEVELOPMENTAL ASSETS (Peter Benson)	Developmental assets have been identified for 4 age ranges but model not developmental-theory guided	Based on decades of data on at-risk behaviors but not just from school discipline data	May now be offering consultative help to schools	Search Institute has been a data-gathering data-based initiative which may or may not include schools	Unknown	Some as reflected in the developmental asset category, boundaries, in home, school, and community	Not stressed but the category of commitment to learning is about motivation	Probably an equal balance of adult and student control	Probably an equal balance of adult and student control	Addressed in developmental asset category of positive values such as responsibility and caring	Addressed through asset category of social skills like peaceful conflict resolution	No specific skills training program
DEVELOPMENT THEORY-BASED CHARACTER & COMMUNITY	One of two programs fully grounded in developmental theory/research	Has not been used for planning but has been used as a measure of	The core curriculum provides a centerpiece but few have used	Among the few programs using this model, all had ongoing data collection	One three year quasi-experimental study in Atlanta showed major	Extrinsic methods recommended but intrinsic favored.	Intrinsic built through deep understanding and use of age appropriate	Kept to a minimum but there is not a relinquishing of control like that	Many recommended strategies promote responsible	Standards that are built from research and theory in affective moral	Adopts the use of a virtue vocabulary that is channeled through age	Standards that are built from research and theory in cognitive moral

BUILDING (Gordon Vessels)	including social and moral	effectiveness	all strategies recommended		reduction in aggression		character standards	seen in constructivism	student control	development	appropriate standards	development
SCHOOL DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM (James Comer)	One of two developmental theory-based programs using developmental pathways: social, ethical, etc.	References to data without emphasis on discipline data	School Planning & Management, and Student & Staff Support Teams plan for school; trainings and consulting	Refers to data-driven decision making, but the exact type of data is unclear.	Several quasi-experimental studies as described in Haynes, Emmons, and Woodruff, 1998	Secondary	Primary and cultivated through focus on emotional attachment of students to teachers	Some sharing of control with students as they learn responsible community membership	Adults share some control with adults students as students learn responsible community membership	Empathy mentioned in reference to social pathway of development	No list of moral assets but these are included in details of social and ethical development such as respect and integrity	Alluded to in references to issues of justice and fairness toward others and self under ethical development